## Global Minimum Tax and Profit Shifting

Tomáš Boukal Charles University Petr Janský Charles University Niels Johannesen Oxford University Miroslav Palanský Charles University, Tax Justice Network



EEA ESEM, Rotterdam, August 2024

All opinions expressed are of the authors and have not been endorsed by the Financial Administration and the Ministry of Finance of the Slovak Republic.

Introducti	ion	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	
Mot	tivat	ion				
≡	Q		F	INANCIAL TIMES	5	
HOME W	ORLD US	OMPANIES TEC	H MARKETS CLIMATE OPINION W	DRK & CAREERS LIFE & ARTS HTSI		
	In 1 i) O te	ternational tax 36 nati n a cen ECD-led pact ch levies	+ Add to myFT ons agree to big tury sets 15% floor aimed at raising	gest corporate tax 1 \$150bn annually as US wins two-y	deal rear ban on	
T Econ	he omist	≡ Menu	Weekly edition The world in I	orief Q Search ∽		
			The World Ahead   Finance in 202 <sup>2</sup> A global mini finally taking	mum tax on firn shape	ns is	

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclus
Motiv	vation				
≡ વ		F	INANCIAL TIME	S	
HOME WORLD	US COMPANIES TECH M	ARKETS CLIMATE OPINION W	ORK & CAREERS LIFE & ARTS HTSI		
	International tax (+ 136 nation in a centur OECD-led pact sets tech levies	Add to myFT Ins agree to big ry 515% floor aimed at raising	gest corporate tax 9 \$150bn annually as US wins two-y	deal rear ban on	
The Econom	<mark>ist</mark> ≡ Menu We	ekly edition The world in I	orief Q Search Y		
	⊕ A fir	The World Ahead   Finance in 2022 global mini nally taking	mum tax on firr shape	ns is	

... but will the global minimum tax reduce profit shifting?

Introduc	tion	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results	decomposition	Conclusion
We	know th	at:					
	There is	a sizeable	e profit shifting	by multinationals;			
	(Álvarez-N	Martínez et	al., 2021; Bilicka	, 2019; Garcia-Bernard	o and	Janský, 2024; Rie	edel,
	2018; Tør	sløv et al.,	2023)				
	The scal	e of profit	t shifting has b	een increasing over	time	.,	

(Clausing, 2016; Garcia-Bernardo, Janský, and Zucman, 2022; Wier and Zucman, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion
We know t	hat:				
There	is a sizeab	le profit shiftin	ig by multinationa	ils;	
(Álvarez	-Martínez et	t al., 2021; Bilick	a, 2019; Garcia-Bern	ardo and Janský, 2024	; Riedel,
2018; T	ørsløv et al.,	2023)			
The sc (Clausin	ale of prof g, 2016; Ga	it shifting has rcia-Bernardo, Ja	been increasing o Inský, and Zucman, 2	ver time; 2022; Wier and Zucma	n, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

The global minimum tax aims to reduce profit shifting.

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion
We know	that:				
There	is a sizeab	le profit shifting	g by multinationals;		
(Álvarez	z-Martínez e	t al., 2021; Bilicka	a, 2019; Garcia-Bernard	do and Janský, 2024	; Riedel,
2018; T	ørsløv et al.	, 2023)			
The sc	ale of prof	it shifting has l	been increasing over	r time;	
(Clausir	ıg, 2016; Ga	rcia-Bernardo, Jar	nský, and Zucman, 202	2; Wier and Zucma	n, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

The global minimum tax aims to reduce profit shifting.

... BUT will the global minimum tax reduce profit shifting?

## Introduction

#### Rationales for the Global Minimum Tax

(#1) Increase tax contribution from large businesses

(#2) Reduce scope for profit shifting

(#3) Level the playing field for firms

### Introduction

#### A set of diagnostics

(#1) Increase tax contribution from large businesses  $\rightarrow$  Higher average tax rate

(#2) Reduce scope for profit shifting  $\rightarrow$  Less tax rate dispersion within firms

(#3) Level the playing field for firms  $\rightarrow$  Less tax rate dispersion across firms

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion

## DATA

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion
Data					

- Firm-level country-by-country reporting data for 788 multinationals
- 20% of all large multinationals globally
- 34 thousand multinational-country observations
- 788 multinationals with activities in Slovakia, 1827 Slovak subsidiaries paired across three data sets: (i) country-by-country reporting data, (ii) tax returns, and (iii) financial statements



# Country-by-country reporting, tax returns and financial statements



### Profitability and effective tax rates: Global



### Profitability and effective tax rates: Slovakia



Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion

## The mechanical impact not accounting for firm or government responses

## RESULTS





above 15%



Carve-outs allow some affiliates to fall down below 15%



## Strikingly low tax rates in the baseline for internal profit centers



Most of the tax increase applies to internal profit centers

Conceptual framework



Introduction

Data

Results: rates

## tax rates in 2020





15%



## Average tax rate across all MNEs increases by around 3 percentage points



## A summary of the results

Data

#### Rationales for the Global Minimum Tax

- (#1) Increase tax contribution from large businesses average rate:  ${\sim}3\%\text{-points}\uparrow$
- global tax bill: ~€200bn ↑
- (#2) Reduce scope for profit shifting
- within-firm tax dispersion  $\downarrow$
- mostly but not only internal profit centers
- (#3) Level the playing field for firms
- between-firm tax dispersion  $\downarrow$

Introduction	Data	Results: rates	Conceptual framework	Results: decomposition	Conclusion

## The impact on tax revenue accounting for firm and government responses

## CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

## Institutional background

Data

#### Which countries:

- Participating
- Implementing
- Non-participating

## Institutional background

Data

#### Which countries:

- Participating
- Implementing
- Non-participating

#### Which top-up taxes

- Domestic top-up tax (QDMTT)
- Headquarter top-up tax (IIR)
- Non-headquarter top-up tax (UTPR)

## Institutional background

#### Which countries:

Introduction

- Participating
- Implementing
- Non-participating

#### Which top-up taxes

- Domestic top-up tax (QDMTT)
- Headquarter top-up tax (IIR)
- Non-headquarter top-up tax (UTPR)

The participation of countries is crucial: (i) only implementing countries can apply top-up taxes and (ii) in an easier way to multinationals in participating countries.

## Global minimum tax, profit shifting and tax revenue

Top-up taxes affect revenue both directly (top-up tax revenue) and indirectly (corporate income tax revenue through profit shifting)

- Increase in top-up taxes applied by the country
- Increase in corporate income tax through less profit shifting out of the country
- Decrease in corporate income tax through less profit shifting in the country

## Global minimum tax, profit shifting and tax revenue

Top-up taxes affect revenue both directly (top-up tax revenue) and indirectly (corporate income tax revenue through profit shifting)

- Increase in top-up taxes applied by the country
- Increase in corporate income tax through less profit shifting out of the country
- Decrease in corporate income tax through less profit shifting in the country

## Global minimum tax, profit shifting and tax revenue

Top-up taxes affect revenue both directly (top-up tax revenue) and indirectly (corporate income tax revenue through profit shifting)

- Increase in top-up taxes applied by the country
- Increase in corporate income tax through less profit shifting out of the country
- Decrease in corporate income tax through less profit shifting in the country

#### **Profit shifting**

- For the estimation of profit shifting we consider Hines & Rice (1994) methodology
- The decreased incentive to shift profit is proportional to changes in the differences in effective tax rates as there will be an increase in minimum taxation
- We consider substance-based carveouts

### Seven components

We decompose the change in tax revenue into:

- Domestic top-up tax
- 2 Headquarter top-up tax
- **3** Non-headquarter top-up tax
- 4 Income tax domestic
- Income tax headquarter
- 6 Income tax other
- Income tax decrease

## **RESULTS: DECOMPOSITION**

## Tax revenue composition based on profit shifting behavior



#### Figure: Changes in profit shifting





### Discussion

#### Key takeaways:

- ▶ Increase average rate:  $\sim$ 3%-points  $\uparrow$  and global tax bill:  $\sim$ €200bn  $\uparrow$
- ▶ Reduce scope for shifting: within-firm tax dispersion  $\downarrow$ , internal profit centers
- Level the playing field for firms: between-firm tax dispersion
- Slovakia's corporate tax revenue will increase by 4% ⇒ half of the increase in top-up taxes, half in corporate income taxes due to halving of profit shifting
- Clearly too soon for a final verdict on the reform and the responses

#### Tomáš Boukal

#### Institute of Economic Studies, Charles University

tomas.boukal@fsv.cuni.cz

## CORP

## **APPENDIX**

Dependent variable: Log of Profit	(1) Linear	(2) Quadratic	(3) Logarithmic
Log of Assets	0.357***	0.357***	0.357***
Log of Assets	(72.11)	(72.37)	(72.28)
Log of Labor	0.419***	0.420***	0.420***
Log of Labor	(55.85)	(56.18)	(56.25)
Effective tax rate	-0.885***	-7.867***	4.246***
Ellective tax fate	(-4.50)	(-13.16)	(9.75)
Effective tax rate (quadratic)		19.410***	
Ellective tax fate (quadratic)		(12.37)	
Effective tax rate (logarithmic)			-0.727***
Ellective tax rate (logarithinic)			(-13.19)
Log of CDP per capita	0.288***	0.301***	0.316***
Log of GDT per capita	(25.73)	(26.85)	(27.82)
Log of Population	0.0757***	0.102***	0.101***
	(7.36)	(12.96)	(12.93)
Constant	3.342***	3.297***	0.430
Constant	(18.22)	(18.04)	(1.50)
N	19,747	19,747	19,747
R2	0.647	0.650	0.650

#### Table: Semielasticity model results

Note: t value in parentheses. \* pj0.05, \*\* pj0.01, \*\*\* pj0.001

For the calculation of tax semi elasticities we use only observations with positive profits. We replace the negative values of tax accrued by 0 and do not allow for higher effective tax rates than 50%. The control variables in terms of GDP per capita and population are taken from World Development Indicators published by the Word Bank.

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Data:** 34 thousand multinational-country observations from country-by-country reports of ca 800 large multinationals headquartered in many countries

#### Main findings:

The global minimum tax increases effective tax rates to up to 15%, but the increase is heterogeneous and lower than without carve-outs

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Data:** 34 thousand multinational-country observations from country-by-country reports of ca 800 large multinationals headquartered in many countries

- The global minimum tax increases effective tax rates to up to 15%, but the increase is heterogeneous and lower than without carve-outs
- The global minimum tax lowers incentives to shift profits for most multinationals, which are likely to pay higher effective tax rates in most countries worldwide.

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Data:** 34 thousand multinational-country observations from country-by-country reports of ca 800 large multinationals headquartered in many countries

- The global minimum tax increases effective tax rates to up to 15%, but the increase is heterogeneous and lower than without carve-outs
- The global minimum tax lowers incentives to shift profits for most multinationals, which are likely to pay higher effective tax rates in most countries worldwide.
- The corporate tax revenues of Slovakia will increase by 4%, with most of the increase due to its minimum top-up taxes.

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Data:** 34 thousand multinational-country observations from country-by-country reports of ca 800 large multinationals headquartered in many countries

- The global minimum tax increases effective tax rates to up to 15%, but the increase is heterogeneous and lower than without carve-outs
- The global minimum tax lowers incentives to shift profits for most multinationals, which are likely to pay higher effective tax rates in most countries worldwide.
- The corporate tax revenues of Slovakia will increase by 4%, with most of the increase due to its minimum top-up taxes.
- The rest of the increase is corporate income tax on profits that will no longer be shifted out of it.

**Research question:** How the global minimum tax affects multinationals, changes profit shifting incentives and impacts tax revenues?

**Data:** 34 thousand multinational-country observations from country-by-country reports of ca 800 large multinationals headquartered in many countries

- The global minimum tax increases effective tax rates to up to 15%, but the increase is heterogeneous and lower than without carve-outs
- The global minimum tax lowers incentives to shift profits for most multinationals, which are likely to pay higher effective tax rates in most countries worldwide.
- The corporate tax revenues of Slovakia will increase by 4%, with most of the increase due to its minimum top-up taxes.
- The rest of the increase is corporate income tax on profits that will no longer be shifted out of it.
- Profit shifting will decrease by slightly more than half and much of it will continue to few European countries that did implement the reform.

## Motivation

#### We know that:

 There is a sizeable profit shifting by multinationals; (Álvarez-Martínez et al., 2021; Bilicka, 2019; Garcia-Bernardo and Janský, 2024; Riedel, 2018; Tørsløv et al., 2023)

The scale of profit shifting has been increasing over time; (Clausing, 2016; Garcia-Bernardo, Janský, and Zucman, 2022; Wier and Zucman, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

## Motivation

#### We know that:

 There is a sizeable profit shifting by multinationals; (Álvarez-Martínez et al., 2021; Bilicka, 2019; Garcia-Bernardo and Janský, 2024; Riedel, 2018; Tørsløv et al., 2023)

The scale of profit shifting has been increasing over time; (Clausing, 2016; Garcia-Bernardo, Janský, and Zucman, 2022; Wier and Zucman, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

The global minimum tax aims to reduce profit shifting.

## Motivation

#### We know that:

There is a sizeable profit shifting by multinationals;
 (Álvarez-Martínez et al., 2021; Bilicka, 2019; Garcia-Bernardo and Janský, 2024; Riedel, 2018; Tørsløv et al., 2023)

The scale of profit shifting has been increasing over time; (Clausing, 2016; Garcia-Bernardo, Janský, and Zucman, 2022; Wier and Zucman, 2022)

The global minimum tax's objective is to reduce profit shifting. (Barake et al., 2021; Cobham et al., 2022; Devereux, 2023; Gomez Cram and Olbert, 2023; Hebous and Keen, 2023; Hugger et al., 2024; Johannesen, 2022; OECD, 2020; Schjelderup and Stähler, 2023)

The global minimum tax aims to reduce profit shifting.

... BUT will the global minimum tax reduce profit shifting?

# Mechanical effect of the global minimum tax on effective tax rates: employees, without carve-outs



## Mechanical effect of the global minimum tax on effective tax rates: employees, with carve-outs



## Mechanical effect of the global minimum tax on effective tax rates: frequency, without carve-outs



# Mechanical effect of the global minimum tax on effective tax rates: frequency, with carve-outs



Boukal, Janský, Johannesen and Palanský

Global Minimum Tax and Profit Shifting

# Composition of tax revenue post-reform, less profit shifted into Slovakia



- Income tax decrease less profit shifting from other countries into Slovakia
- Top-up tax on undertaxed profits companies shifting profits out of Slovakia
- Top-up tax on undertaxed profits companies shifting profits to Slovakia
- C Top-up tax forgone with respect to baseline (retrospective) scenario, companies shifting less profits to Slovakia

## Distribution of multinationals' activities according to their effective tax rates



Slovakia

## A hypothetical example



	Luxembourg	Austria	Slovakia	Top-up tax recipient
Domestic top-up tax	Implementing with domestic top-up tax	Implementing Participating domestic top-up tax or implementing		Luxembourg
Headquarter top-up tax	Participating or implementing (without domestic top-up tax)	Implementing	-	Austria
Non-headquarter top-up tax	Participating or implementing (without domestic top-up tax)	Participating	Implementing	Slovakia
No Taxation	Non-participating	-	-	No taxation

## Correlation coefficients for individual data sources



# Changes in Profit Shifting Due to the Introduction of Global Minimum Tax

Out of Slovakia	760	386	49%	887	433	51%	1850	1138	38%
Income tax domestic	449	212	53%	482	218	55%	962	562	42%
Income tax headquarter	275	89	53%	275	141	49%	605	367	39%
Income tax third country	99	68	60%	113	56	50%	258	182	29%
Non-participating	18	18	0%	15	15	0%	25	25	0%
Into Slovakia	121	83	31%	105	65	39%	692	511	26%