The Racial Wealth Gap: the Role of Entrepreneurship

Daniel Albuquerque¹ Tomer Ifergane²

EEA Congress

August 30, 2023

¹Bank of England - The views expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not represent those of the Bank of England or any of its committees.

²LSE - CFM & BGU Econ. This research was supported by THE ISRAEL SCIENCE FOUNDATION (grant No.51/22).

Wealth and race are correlated in the U.S.



Wealth Distribution by Race

- Wealth and race are correlated in the U.S.
- The racial wealth gap is substantial, persistent and stable



 $gap = \frac{\text{Average assets White HH} - \text{Average assets Black HH}}{\text{Average assets White HH}}$

Wealth and race are correlated in the U.S.

- The racial wealth gap is substantial, persistent and stable
- Q1: How important are labour market outcomes vs entrepreneurship as determinants of the racial wealth gap?



 $gap = \frac{\text{Average assets White HH}-\text{Average assets Black HH}}{\text{Average assets White HH}}$

Wealth and race are correlated in the U.S.

- The racial wealth gap is substantial, persistent and stable
- Q1: How important are labour market outcomes vs entrepreneurship as determinants of the racial wealth gap?
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?



 $gap = \frac{\text{Average assets White HH}-\text{Average assets Black HH}}{\text{Average assets White HH}}$

- Build a quantitative macro model
- Racial disparities in wealth are a result of differences in:
 - the labour market: wage distortion + labour market attachment distortion
 - as entrepreneurs: capital cost distortion

- Build a quantitative macro model
- Racial disparities in wealth are a result of differences in:
 - the labour market: wage distortion + labour market attachment distortion Freeman

(1973); Card and Krueger (1992); Donohue and Heckman (1991); Neal and Johnson (1996); Darity and Mason (1998); Altonji and Blank (1999); Carneiro et al. (2005); Lang and Lehmann (2012); Chandra (2003); Bayer and Charles (2018)

as entrepreneurs: capital cost distortion Blanchflower et al. (2003); Blanchard et al. (2008);
 Cavalluzzo and Wolken (2005); García and Darity Jr (2021); Dougal et al. (2019); Hu et al. (2011);
 Atkins et al. (2022); Bates and Robb (2016); Fairlie et al. (2022); Bento et al. (2022)

- Build a quantitative macro model
- Racial disparities in wealth are a result of differences in:
 - the labour market: wage distortion + labour market attachment distortion
 - as entrepreneurs: capital cost distortion

∜

Untargeted racial wealth gap arising from three exogenous distortions

- Build a quantitative macro model
- Racial disparities in wealth are a result of differences in:
 - the labour market: wage distortion + labour market attachment distortion
 - as entrepreneurs: capital cost distortion

∜

Untargeted racial wealth gap arising from three exogenous distortions

Quantify the relative contribution of each distortion to the gap and the wealth distribution

- Build a quantitative macro model
- Racial disparities in wealth are a result of differences in:
 - the labour market: wage distortion + labour market attachment distortion
 - as entrepreneurs: capital cost distortion
 - ∜

Untargeted racial wealth gap arising from three exogenous distortions

- Quantify the relative contribution of each distortion to the gap and the wealth distribution
- Analyse how long it would take to close the racial wealth gap explore the role of policies

• Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?

• Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap

• Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Image: Racial wealth gap = persistent initial conditions + barriers to entrepreneurship
 Entrepreneurship gap ↓ ⇒ top income converges ⇒ wealth gap is eliminated
 Parity in wealth outcomes is only stable with parity in top incomes
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Image: Racial wealth gap = persistent initial conditions + barriers to entrepreneurship
 Entrepreneurship gap ↓ ⇒ top income converges ⇒ wealth gap is eliminated
 Parity in wealth outcomes is only stable with parity in top incomes
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Is a constructed and the set of the set o
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?
 - If we do nothing \Rightarrow the gap will remain

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Image Racial wealth gap = persistent initial conditions + barriers to entrepreneurship
 Entrepreneurship gap ↓ ⇒ top income converges ⇒ wealth gap is eliminated
 Parity in wealth outcomes is only stable with parity in top incomes
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?
 - **1** If we do nothing \Rightarrow the gap will remain
 - It would take 200 years to close the gap if all distortions were eliminated today

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Image: Racial wealth gap = persistent initial conditions + barriers to entrepreneurship
 Entrepreneurship gap ↓ ⇒ top income converges ⇒ wealth gap is eliminated
 Parity in wealth outcomes is only stable with parity in top incomes
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?
 - 1) If we do nothing \Rightarrow the gap will remain
 - It would take 200 years to close the gap if all distortions were eliminated today
 - Wealth transfers are insufficient without social change

- Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap?
 - Barriers to entrepreneurship are key
 - 2 Labour market conditions second order importance for the gap
 - Is a constructed and the set of the set o
- Q2: What is the potential role of policies in closing it?
 - **1** If we do nothing \Rightarrow the gap will remain
 - It would take 200 years to close the gap if all distortions were eliminated today
 - Wealth transfers are insufficient without social change
 - Policies targeting barriers to Black entrepreneurship are a promising direction

The Racial Wealth Gap

Literature

Most closely related papers:

- Aliprantis, Carroll, and Young (2019)
- Ashman and Neumuller (2020)
- Boerma and Karabarbounis (2022)
- This paper unifying approach

labour income gap + higher unemp. risk + barriers to entrepreneurship \rightarrow wealth gap Quantitative conclusion - barriers to entrepreneurship are key



Stylized facts - differences in wealth and entrepreneurship

2 Model



Comparative statics - what is the contribution of each distortion to the gap?

Transition - how long to close the racial wealth gap?

Stylized Facts

Stylized Facts - The Racial Wealth Gap is stable



Stylized Facts - Entrepreneurship Wealth and Race

 Black households are nearly three times less likely to be entrepreneurs

Entrepreneurship Rates by Race



Stylized Facts - Entrepreneurship Wealth and Race

- Black households are nearly three times less likely to be entrepreneurs
- Entrepreneurs are over-represented at the top of the wealth distribution

Entrepreneurship Along the Wealth Distribution



Model

Model - Environment

Incomplete market economy with a discrete entrepreneurship choice in GE:

- Infinity lived households (dynasties) workers or entrepreneurs that consume and save
- Workers face idiosyncratic income risk empirically estimated income process
- Workers can choose to become entrepreneurs
- Entrepreneurs have income from profits, productivity grows stochastically
- Entrepreneurs face a credit constraint; have a constant exit rate back to worker

Model - Racial Disparities

We model Black and White households as ex-ante identical but:

- Solution Black workers face a proportional wage distortion $w (1 \omega^B)$
- Black workers experience different transition rates from employment to non-employment and vice versa, which are empirically estimated
- Slack entrepreneurs face higher cost of capital $r(1 + \tau_K^B)$ reduced-form barrier to entrepreneurship

Model - Labour Income Process

We model income = $(1 - \omega^i)wz_L$, where



The permanent and transitory components follow a jump-drift process given by:

$$dz_{P,t} = -\mu_P z_{P,t} dt + dJ_{P,t},$$

$$dz_{T,t} = -\mu_T z_{T,t} dt + dJ_{T,t},$$

where $dJ_{P,t}$ has an arrival rate of λ_P , mean equal to zero and variance equal to σ_P^2 . Households of race *i* switch from employment status *l* to *l'* according to $\lambda_{ll'}^i$.

Model - Production and Profits

The entrepreneurs maximizes profits by hiring labour h and capital k:

$$\pi (a, z_F, i) = \begin{cases} \max_{k,h} z_F k^{\alpha} h^{\beta} - wh - r \left(1 + \tau_K^i \right) k, & \alpha + \beta < 1 \\ s.t. & k \leq a \lambda_{CC} \end{cases}$$

Business productivity z_F follows a geometric Brownian motion generating a stable Pareto distribution with a tail parameter ζ .



Notations: w wage per z_L asset holdings a rental rate r τ_{K}^{i} capital distortion λ_{CC} collateral constraint λ_D exit rate ζ tail param. z_F

(1)

Calibration

Calibration

	Externally calibrated parameters						
Parameter	Value	Target	Model	CRRA utility	1.5	α	0.3
ρ	8.5%	net return of 4%	4%	δ	0.048	β	0.5
ς	7	top 10% wealth share of 72.3%	73.8%	$\frac{\sigma_F}{1-\alpha-\beta}$	0.12	λ_D	0.1
λ_{CC}	4.2	annual capital/output ratio 3	3				
η	0.045	population entrepreneurship rate of 12.7%	12.9%				
$ au_K$	0.72	entrepreneurship gap of 9%	9%				
\underline{a}	-0.48	% of households with negative net wealth of 11%	11.7%				
au	14%	Model income floor 34% of median income	34%				

income process

Racial Disparities in Entrepreneurship & Wealth - Model vs Data

Entrepreneurship Rate Conditional on Wealth Quantile by Race



Untargeted racial wealth gap = 81.4% (data = 83.4%)

Results

Results - The Contribution of The Distortions to the Racial Wealth Gap



Share of Black Households Conditional on Wealth Quantile

Bottom 50% ■ 50%-90% ■ 90%-99% ■ Top 1%

Results - The Contribution of The Distortions to the Racial Wealth Gap



Share of Black Households Conditional on Wealth Quantile

Daniel Albuquerque, Tomer Ifergane

The Racial Wealth Gap

How Long to Close the Racial Wealth Gap?



Can Wealth Transfers Help?



Can Wealth Transfers Help?



Q1: What are the determinants of the racial wealth gap? **Q2:** What is the potential role of policies in closing it?

- Differences in entrepreneurship account for most of the racial wealth gap
- Closing the racial wealth gap will take a long time
- Wealth transfers are insufficient without social change ...
- ... but policies targeting barriers to Black entrepreneurship are a promising direction

The Contribution of the Distortions to the Racial Wealth Inequality -

Workers vs. Entrepreneurs **Main**





The model has four clearing conditions

Asset market - r

Market Clearing Conditions

The model has four clearing conditions

Asset market - r

$$\sum_{i=\{B,W\}} \left(\int_{\underline{z}_{L}}^{\overline{z}_{L}} \int_{\underline{a}}^{\infty} \mathbf{a} \, \mu_{L}\left(a, z_{L}, i\right) \, da \, dz_{L} + \int_{\underline{z}_{F}}^{\overline{z}_{F}} \int_{\underline{a}}^{\infty} \mathbf{a} \, \mu_{E}\left(a, z_{F}, i\right) \, da \, dz_{F} \right) =$$

$$\underbrace{\sum_{i=\{B,W\}} \int_{\underline{z}_{F}}^{\overline{z}_{F}} \int_{\underline{a}}^{\infty} \mathbf{k} \left(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{z}_{F}, \mathbf{i}\right) \mu_{E}\left(a, z_{F}, i\right) \, da \, dz_{F}}_{\text{capital demand}}$$

- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w

Market Clearing Conditions

- Asset market r
- Labour market w



- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w
- 3 Government budget T

Market Clearing Conditions

The model has four clearing conditions

- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w
- Government budget T

$$\underbrace{\tau_{\pi}(\mathbf{1}+\hat{\gamma}_{\pi})\Pi}_{\text{income from profit tax}} + \underbrace{\tau_{w}w}_{i=\{B,W\}} \int_{\underline{z}_{L}}^{\overline{z}_{L}} \int_{\underline{a}}^{\infty} \mathbf{z}_{L} \left(\mathbf{1}-\boldsymbol{\omega}^{i}\right) \mu_{L}\left(a,z_{L},i\right) \, da \, dz_{L} + \underbrace{\mathbf{ncome from labour income tax}}_{\text{income from labour income tax}} \left(\int_{\underline{z}_{L}}^{\overline{z}_{L}} \int_{0}^{\infty} \mathbf{a} \, \mu_{L}\left(a,z_{L},i\right) \, da \, dz_{L} + \int_{\underline{z}_{F}}^{\overline{z}_{F}} \int_{0}^{\infty} \mathbf{a} \, \mu_{E}\left(a,z_{F},i\right) \, da \, dz_{F}\right)$$

income from capital income tax

 $= \mathbf{T}(\mathbf{1} - \mathbf{m}_{\mathbf{E}})$

- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w
- Government budget T
- Excess profits $\hat{\gamma_{\pi}}$

Market Clearing Conditions

- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w
- 3 Government budget T
- Excess profits $\hat{\gamma_{\pi}}$



- Asset market r
- 2 Labour market w
- 3 Government budget T
- Excess profits $\hat{\gamma_{\pi}}$
- Consistency condition (helpful in practice) m_E is consistent with our guess

Model - Worker's Problem Back

Workers of group $i \in \{B, W\}$ choose consumption c, given their asset level a, efficiency units of labour z_L + race-dependent distortions

$$\rho V(a, z_L, i) = \max_{c} u(c) +$$

$$\frac{\partial V}{\partial a} \left[\underbrace{wz_L(1 - \omega^i)(1 - \tau_w)}_{\text{labour income}} + \underbrace{(1 - \tau_a I_{a>0})(r - \delta)a}_{\text{capital income}} - c + \underbrace{T}_{\text{Transfer benefit}} \right] +$$

$$\eta \underbrace{\max \left\{ F(a, \underline{z_F}, i) - V(a, z_L, i), 0 \right\}}_{\text{option to become entrep.}} + \underbrace{A_{z_L}(i)V(a, z_L, i)}_{\text{income process - permanent, transitory, E/NE}}$$
(2)

Notations: discount rate D CRRA util. u(c)11) wage per z_L ω^i wage distortion income tax τ_{m} $r-\delta$ net return cap. income tax τ_a labour prod. z_L denerator of z_L A_{z_L} process Vworker val. func. Fentrep. val. func. entrant prod. z_F idea arrival rate n

Model - Entrepreneur's Problem

Entrepreneur of group $i \in \{B, W\}$ choose consumption c, given their asset level a, and business productivity z_F + race-dependent distortions

$$\rho F(a, z_F, i) = \max_{c} u(c) +$$

$$\frac{\partial F}{\partial a} \left[\underbrace{(1 - \tau_{\pi}) (1 + \hat{\gamma_{\pi}}) \pi(z_F, a, i)}_{\text{profit income}} + \underbrace{(1 - \tau_a I_{a>0}) (r - \delta)a}_{\text{capital income}} - c \right] +$$

$$\lambda_D \underbrace{E_{z_L}[V(a, z_L, i) - F(a, z_F, i)]}_{\text{value of becoming a worker again}} + \underbrace{A_{z_F}F(a, z_F, i)}_{\text{stochastic process for productivity}}$$
(3)

Notations: discount rate 0 u(c)CRRA util. wade per z_L w $\hat{\gamma_{\pi}}$ excess profits prof. income tax au_{π} $r - \delta$ net return cap. income tax τ_a labour prod. z_L λ_D exit rate Azr denerator of z_F process Vworker val. func. Fentrep. val. func.

Labour Income Process Dack

We model the following income process

$$z_{L,j,t}(\underbrace{l_{t,j}}_{\mathsf{E}/\mathsf{NE}},\underbrace{z_{P,j,t}}_{\mathsf{permanent comp. transitory comp.}},\underbrace{z_{T,j,t}}_{\mathsf{transitory comp.}}) = l_{t,j} \times e^{z_{P,j,t} + z_{T,j,t}}$$
(4)

Estimation: PSID 2001 - 2019, ages 25 - 65, males, labour income of households

- Wage distortion: $\omega^B = 31.3\%$
- Estimate income process parameters
- Optimize grid for best discretized analogue

Employment status transition rates

$Employment \to Non-employment, B$	λ^B_{10}	17.1%
$Employment \to Non-employment, W$	λ^W_{10}	6.2%
Non-employment \rightarrow Employment, B	λ^B_{01}	81.9%
$\text{Non-employment} \to \text{Employment, W}$	λ^W_{01}	72.6%

Labour Income Process Estimation

Moments targeted:

	Moments					Moments		
	(1) Data	1) Data (2) Model	(3) Discretised		(1) Data	(2) Model	(3) Discretised	
	(1) Data		Model		(1) Data		Model	
fraction wage = 0, Black	16.6%	16.5%	9.1%	kurtosis $\Delta 2y$	7.5	7.7	7.3	
fraction wage = 0, White	7.8%	7.7%	4.6%	kurtosis Δ 4y	6.5	6.0	6.5	
wage low, Black	8.8%	8.5%	9.3%	kurtosis Δ 6y	6.1	6.6	6.8	
wage low, White	5.1%	4.9%	4.9%	fraction $\Delta 2y < 5\%$	18.5%	20.6%	35.8%	
std Δ 2y	0.44	0.45	0.43	fraction $\Delta 2y < 10\%$	34.2%	32.3%	41.4%	
std Δ 4y	0.51	0.54	0.51	fraction $\Delta 2y < 20\%$	55.1%	45.2%	57.7%	
std Δ 6y	0.55	0.59	0.55					

Labour Income Process Estimation

Estimation results:

Labour income					
Racial wage gap	ω^B	31.3%			
Mean reversion, permanent	μ_P	0.002%			
Mean reversion, transitory	μ_T	14.4%			
Volatility of jumps, permanent	σ_P^2	0.99			
Volatility of jumps, transitory	σ_T^2	0.49			
Rate of arrival of jumps, permanent	λ_P	1.0%			
Rate of arrival of jumps, transitory	λ_T	30.3%			

Employment status transition rates

$Employment \to Non-employment, B$	λ^B_{10}	17.1%
$Employment \to Non-employment, W$	λ^W_{10}	6.2%
Non-employment \rightarrow Employment, B	λ^B_{01}	81.9%
Non-employment \rightarrow Employment, W	λ^W_{01}	72.6%

Labour Income Gaps (PSID)



- Altonji, J. G. and Blank, R. M. (1999). Race and gender in the labor market. *Handbook of labor economics*, 3:3143–3259.
- Atkins, R. M., Cook, L., and Seamans, R. (2022). Using technology to tackle discrimination in lending: The role of fintechs in the paycheck protection program. AEA Papers and Proceedings, 112:296–298.
- Bates, T. and Robb, A. (2016). Impacts of owner race and geographic context on access to small-business financing. *Economic Development Quarterly*, 30(2):159–170.
- Bayer, P. and Charles, K. K. (2018). Divergent paths: A new perspective on earnings differences between black and white men since 1940. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 133(3):1459–1501.
- Bento, P., Hwang, S., et al. (2022). Easier to start, harder to succeed: Barriers to black entrepreneurship since the great recession. *AEA Papers and Proceedings*, 112:292–295.
 Blanchard, L., Zhao, B., and Yinger, J. (2008). Do lenders discriminate against minority and woman entrepreneurs? *Journal of Urban Economics*, 63(2):467–497.

Daniel Albuquerque, Tomer Ifergane

The Racial Wealth Gap

- Blanchflower, D. G., Levine, P. B., and Zimmerman, D. J. (2003). Discrimination in the small-business credit market. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 85(4):930–943.
- Card, D. and Krueger, A. B. (1992). School quality and black-white relative earnings: A direct assessment. *The quarterly journal of Economics*, 107(1):151–200.
- Carneiro, P., Heckman, J. J., and Masterov, D. V. (2005). Understanding the sources of ethnic and racial wage gaps and their implications for policy. In *Handbook of employment discrimination research*, pages 99–136.
- Cavalluzzo, K. and Wolken, J. (2005). Small business loan turndowns, personal wealth, and discrimination. *The Journal of Business*, 78(6):2153–2178.
- Chandra, A. (2003). Is the convergence of the racial wage gap illusory? Technical report, National Bureau of Economic Research.

Darity, W. A. and Mason, P. L. (1998). Evidence on discrimination in employment: Codes of color, codes of gender. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 12(2):63–90.

- Donohue, J. and Heckman, J. (1991). Continuous vs. episodic change: The impact of civil rights policy on the economic status of blacks. *Journal of Economic Literature*, (29:4):1603–43.
- Dougal, C., Gao, P., Mayew, W. J., and Parsons, C. A. (2019). What's in a (school) name? racial discrimination in higher education bond markets. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 134(3):570–590.
- Fairlie, R., Robb, A., and Robinson, D. T. (2022). Black and white: Access to capital among minority-owned start-ups. *Management Science*, 68(4):2377–2400.
- Freeman, R. B. (1973). Changes in the labor market for black americans, 1948-72. *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity*, 1973(1):67–131.

García, R. E. and Darity Jr, W. A. (2021). Self-reporting race in small business loans: A game-theoretic analysis of evidence from ppp loans in durham, nc. *AEA Papers and Proceedings*.

- Hu, Y., Liu, L., Ondrich, J., and Yinger, J. (2011). The racial and gender interest rate gap in small business lending: Improved estimates using matching methods. Working paper.
- Lang, K. and Lehmann, J.-Y. K. (2012). Racial discrimination in the labor market: Theory and empirics. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 50(4):959–1006.
- Neal, D. A. and Johnson, W. R. (1996). The role of premarket factors in black-white wage differences. *Journal of political Economy*, 104(5):869–895.